

ETHICS PROGRAM INSPECTION REPORT

Agency: Privacy and Civil Liberties Oversight Board

Report No.: 26-19I

Date: 3/19/2026

Period Covered by Review: January 1, 2025 through December 31, 2025

UNITED STATES OFFICE OF
GOVERNMENT ETHICSPreventing Conflicts of Interest
in the Executive Branch

1.0 AGENCY DATA		
EMPLOYEES		
1.1	Number of full-time agency employees.	26
1.2	Number of Presidentially appointed, Senate-confirmed (PAS) public financial disclosure reports required to be filed.	4
1.3	Number of non-PAS public financial disclosure reports required to be filed.	1
1.4	Number of confidential financial disclosure reports required to be filed.	3
ETHICS PROGRAM		
1.5	Title of Designated Agency Ethics Official (DAEO).	General Counsel
1.6	Grade level of DAEO.	GS-15 (equivalent)
1.7	Title of Alternate DAEO (ADAEO).	Deputy General Counsel
1.8	Grade level of ADAEO.	GS-15 (equivalent)
1.9	Title of the primary, day-to-day ethics program administrator.	Deputy General Counsel
1.10	Grade level of the primary, day-to-day ethics program administrator.	GS-15 (equivalent)
1.11	Current number of full-time ethics officials.	2
1.12	Current number of part-time ethics officials.	0
1.13	Number of reporting levels between the DAEO and the agency head.	1
COMMENTS		
None.		

2.0 LEADERSHIP					
COMPLIANCE REQUIREMENTS			Yes	No	N/A
2.1	OGE has received an up-to-date designation from the agency head naming the DAEO. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.107(a).	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
2.2	OGE has received an up-to-date designation from the agency head naming the ADAEO. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.107(a).	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
COMMENTS					
None.					

3.0 PUBLIC FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE (OGE Form 278e, OGE Form 278-T)							
COMPLIANCE REQUIREMENTS					Yes	No	N/A
The agency has written policies and procedures in place governing: <i>See</i> 5 U.S.C. app. IV, § 402(d)(1).							
3.1	• Collection of public financial disclosure reports.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>			
3.2	• Review/evaluation of public financial disclosure reports.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>			
3.3	• Public availability of public financial disclosure reports.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>			
3.4	The agency can demonstrate that late filing fees are collected or, where appropriate, waivers are issued when public filers do not timely file financial disclosure reports.	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>			
3.5	Public financial disclosure reports are securely maintained. <i>See</i> OGE/GOVT-1.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>			

ETHICS PROGRAM INSPECTION REPORT

Agency: Privacy and Civil Liberties Oversight Board

Report No.: 26-19I

Date: 3/19/2026

Period Covered by Review: January 1, 2025 through December 31, 2025

**UNITED STATES OFFICE OF
GOVERNMENT ETHICS**


 Preventing Conflicts of Interest
 in the Executive Branch

3.6	Public financial disclosure reports are retained in accordance with the retention requirements. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.603(g)(1).	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3.7	There is reasonable assurance that the lead human resources official or designee promptly (no later than 15 days after appointment) notifies the DAEO of all appointments to positions that require incumbents to file public financial disclosure reports. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.105(a)(1).	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3.8	There is reasonable assurance that the lead human resources official or designee promptly (no later than 15 days after termination) notified the DAEO of terminations of employees in positions that require incumbents to file public financial disclosure reports. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.105(a)(2).	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
DATA ANALYSIS		%		
3.9	Percentage of sampled non-PAS new entrant reports filed timely. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.201(b).	N/A		
3.10	Percentage of sampled non-PAS annual reports filed timely. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.201(a).	N/A		
3.11	Percentage of sampled non-PAS termination reports filed timely. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.201(e).	100%		
3.12	Percentage of sampled non-PAS public financial disclosure reports reviewed within 60 days of receipt. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.605(a).	100%		
3.13	Percentage of sampled non-PAS public financial disclosure reports certified within 60 days of receipt. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.605(a).	0%		
3.14	Percentage of sampled PAS annual reports filed timely. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.201(a).	100%		
3.15	Percentage of sampled PAS termination reports filed timely. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.201(e).	33%		
3.16	Percentage of sampled PAS annual and termination reports reviewed within 60 days of receipt. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.605(a).	50%		
3.17	Percentage of sampled PAS annual and termination reports certified within 60 days of receipt. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.605(a).	50%		
COMMENTS				
<p>3.10: PCLOB's other non-PAS 278 filer was a transfer from a different agency, and the individual filed with that agency. Their data is not reflected in this report.</p> <p>3.15, 3.17: PCLOB informed OGE that two PAS 278 filers were terminated at the beginning of 2025. The employees challenged their terminations (see agency response). The employees are reflected in this report as termination filers. OGE will revisit this finding if the employees are reinstated at the conclusion of litigation.</p>				

4.0	CONFIDENTIAL FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE			
COMPLIANCE REQUIREMENTS		Yes	No	N/A
The agency has written policies and procedures in place governing: <i>See</i> 5 U.S.C app. IV, § 402(d)(1).				
4.1	• Collection of confidential financial disclosure reports.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4.2	• Review/evaluation of confidential financial disclosure reports.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4.3	Confidential financial disclosure reports are securely maintained. <i>See</i> OGE/GOVT-2.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4.4	Confidential financial disclosure reports are retained in accordance with the retention requirements. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.604.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4.5	The agency's OGE-approved alternative confidential financial disclosure system complies with plans approved by OGE. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.905(a).	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
4.6	There is reasonable assurance that the lead human resources official or designee promptly (no later than 15 days after appointment) notifies the DAEO of all appointments to positions that require incumbents to file confidential financial disclosure reports. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.105(a)(1).	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
DATA ANALYSIS		%		

ETHICS PROGRAM INSPECTION REPORT

Agency: Privacy and Civil Liberties Oversight Board

Report No.: 26-19I

Date: 3/19/2026

Period Covered by Review: January 1, 2025 through December 31, 2025

**UNITED STATES OFFICE OF
GOVERNMENT ETHICS**


 Preventing Conflicts of Interest
 in the Executive Branch

4.7	Percentage of sampled confidential new entrant reports filed timely. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.903(b).	N/A
4.8	Percentage of sampled confidential annual reports filed timely. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.903(a).	67%
4.9	Percentage of sampled reports reviewed within 60 days of receipt. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.605(a).	100%
4.10	Percentage of sampled confidential financial disclosure reports certified within 60 days of receipt. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. §§ 2634.605(a) and 2634.909(a).	100%
COMMENTS		
4.7: No new entrant confidential filers were hired during the period covered by the review.		

5.0 NOTICES TO PROSPECTIVE EMPLOYEES						
COMPLIANCE REQUIREMENTS				Yes	No	N/A
Written offers of employment for positions covered by the Standards of Conduct provide: <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.303.						
5.1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A statement regarding the agency’s commitment to government ethics. 	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
5.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Notice that the individual will be subject to the Standards of Conduct and the criminal conflict of interest statutes as an employee. 	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
5.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contact information for an appropriate agency ethics office or an explanation of how to obtain additional information on applicable ethics requirements. 	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
5.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Where applicable, notice of the time frame for completing initial ethics training. 	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
5.5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Where applicable, a statement regarding financial disclosure requirements and an explanation that new entrant reports must be filed within 30 days of appointment. 	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		
5.6	The agency has established written procedures for issuing the notice to prospective employees. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.303(c).	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
5.7	The agency’s written procedures are reviewed by the DAEO each year. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.303(c).	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
5.8	The agency can demonstrate that there is an effective process for ensuring all covered employees receive the required information with their written offer of employment. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.303.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
COMMENTS						
None.						

6.0 NOTICES TO NEW SUPERVISORS						
COMPLIANCE REQUIREMENTS				Yes	No	N/A
The agency must provide each employee upon initial appointment to a supervisory position with: <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.306.						
6.1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contact information for the agency’s ethics office. 	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
6.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The text of 5 C.F.R. § 2638.103. 	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
6.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A copy of, a hyperlink to, or the address of a Web site containing the Principles of Ethical Conduct. 	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
6.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Other information the DAEO deems necessary. 	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		
6.5	The agency has established written procedures for supervisory ethics notices. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.306(d).	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
6.6	The agency’s written procedures are reviewed by the DAEO each year. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.306(d).	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
6.7	The agency can demonstrate that there is an effective process for ensuring that new supervisors receive the required information within one year of appointment. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.306(b).	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		

ETHICS PROGRAM INSPECTION REPORT

Agency: Privacy and Civil Liberties Oversight Board

Report No.: 26-19I

Date: 3/19/2026

Period Covered by Review: January 1, 2025 through December 31, 2025

**UNITED STATES OFFICE OF
GOVERNMENT ETHICS**


 Preventing Conflicts of Interest
 in the Executive Branch

	COMMENTS
	None.

7.0 INITIAL ETHICS TRAINING				
	COMPLIANCE REQUIREMENTS	Yes	No	N/A
	Each new employee of the agency subject to the Standards of Conduct must complete initial ethics training. <i>See 5 C.F.R. § 2638.304.</i>			
7.1	The training presentation(s) addressed concepts related to conflicts of interest, impartiality, misuse of position and gifts. <i>See 5 C.F.R. § 2638.304(e)(1).</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.2	The agency provided new employees with either the following written materials or written instruction for accessing them: The summary of the Standards of Conduct distributed by the Office of Government Ethics or an equivalent summary prepared by the agency; provisions of any supplemental agency regulation that the DAEO determines to be relevant or a summary of those provisions; such other written materials as the DAEO determines should be included; instructions for contacting the agency's ethics officials. <i>See 5 C.F.R. § 2638.304(e)(2).</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.3	The agency has established written procedures for initial ethics training. <i>See 5 C.F.R. § 2638.304(f).</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.4	The agency's written procedures are reviewed by the DAEO each year. <i>See 5 C.F.R. § 2638.304(f).</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	DATA ANALYSIS	%		
7.5	Percentage of new employees who received initial ethics training. <i>See 5 C.F.R. § 2638.304.</i>	100%		
7.6	Percentage of new employees who received initial ethics training within three months of appointment. <i>See 5 C.F.R. § 2638.304(b).</i>	100%		
COMMENTS				
	None.			

8.0 ANNUAL ETHICS TRAINING				
	COMPLIANCE REQUIREMENTS	Yes	No	N/A
	Each calendar year, public filers, confidential filers, and certain other employees must complete ethics training which meets specified requirements. <i>See 5 C.F.R. §§ 2638.307 and 2638.308.</i>			
8.1	The training presentation(s) addressed concepts related to financial conflicts of interest, impartiality, misuse of position and gifts. <i>See 5 C.F.R. §§ 2638.307(e)(1) and 2638.308(f)(1).</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
8.2	The agency provided employees with either the following written materials or written instruction for accessing them: The summary of the Standards of Conduct distributed by the Office of Government Ethics or an equivalent summary prepared by the agency; provisions of any supplemental agency regulation that the DAEO determines to be relevant or a summary of those provisions; such other written materials as the DAEO determines should be included; instructions for contacting the agency's ethics officials. <i>See 5 C.F.R. § 2638.304(e)(2).</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
8.3	The agency's annual ethics training complies with the formatting requirements for public filers, confidential filers, and certain other employees. <i>See 5 C.F.R. §§ 2638.307(d) and 2638.308(e).</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
8.4	The agency's program for annual ethics training complies with the tracking requirements for public filers, confidential filers, and certain other employees. <i>See 5 C.F.R. §§ 2638.307(f) and 2638.308(g).</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
8.5	The agency can demonstrate it has an effective process for ensuring covered public filers, other than those whose pay is set at Level I or Level II of the Executive Schedule, complete live annual ethics training at least once every two years. <i>See 5 C.F.R. § 2638.308(e)(2).</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	DATA ANALYSIS	Training Format		

ETHICS PROGRAM INSPECTION REPORT

Agency: Privacy and Civil Liberties Oversight Board

Report No.: 26-19I

Date: 3/19/2026

Period Covered by Review: January 1, 2025 through December 31, 2025

UNITED STATES OFFICE OF GOVERNMENT ETHICS

Preventing Conflicts of Interest
in the Executive Branch

		Live	Interactive
	Percentage of public filers who completed annual ethics training before the end of the calendar year. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.308(a).		
8.6	• Executive Schedule Level I and Level II. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.308(e)(1).	N/A	N/A
8.7	• Other PAS and Equivalent. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.308(e)(2).	20%	80%
8.8	• SES and Equivalent. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.308(e)(3).	0%	100%
	Percentage of confidential filers and certain other employees who completed annual ethics training before the end of the calendar year. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.307(a)(d).		
8.9	• Employees required to file an annual confidential financial disclosure report. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.307(a)(1).	0%	100%
8.10	• Employees appointed by the President. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.307(a)(2).	N/A	N/A
8.11	• Employees of the Executive Office of the President. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.307(a)(2).	N/A	N/A
8.12	• Contracting officers described in 41 U.S.C. § 2101. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.307(a)(3).	N/A	N/A
8.13	• Other employees designated by the head of the agency. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.307(a)(4).	0%	100%
COMMENTS			
8.7: PCLOB's board members are PAS and all file public financial disclosure forms; their data is captured in this section.			

9.0 ETHICS ADVICE AND COUNSELING

	COMPLIANCE REQUIREMENT	Yes	No	N/A
9.1	Based on a sample collected by OGE, guidance provided by agency ethics officials to employees appears to be consistent with applicable laws and regulations. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.104(c)(4).	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
COMMENTS				
None.				

10.0 SPECIAL GOVERNMENT EMPLOYEES (SGE) SERVING ON ADVISORY COMMITTEES AND BOARDS

Confidential Financial Disclosure

10.1	Number of SGEs serving on Advisory Committees and Boards.	3
	DATA ANALYSIS	%
10.2	Percentage of sampled confidential new entrant reports filed timely. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.903(b).	N/A
10.3	Percentage of sampled reports reviewed within 60 days of receipt but not later than the SGE's first meeting. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.605(a).	N/A
10.4	Percentage of sampled reports certified within 60 days of receipt. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2634.605(a).	N/A

Ethics Training

	COMPLIANCE REQUIREMENTS	Yes	No	N/A
	Required ethics training must be provided to each SGE. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. §§ 2638.304 and 2638.307.			
10.5	The training presentation(s) addressed concepts related to conflicts of interest, impartiality, misuse of position and gifts. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.304(e)(1).	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

ETHICS PROGRAM INSPECTION REPORT

Agency: Privacy and Civil Liberties Oversight Board

Report No.: 26-19I

Date: 3/19/2026

Period Covered by Review: January 1, 2025 through December 31, 2025



10.6	The agency provided employees with either the following written materials or written instruction for accessing them: The summary of the Standards of Conduct distributed by the Office of Government Ethics or an equivalent summary prepared by the agency; provisions of any supplemental agency regulation that the DAEO determines to be relevant or a summary of those provisions; such other written materials as the DAEO determines should be included; instructions for contacting the agency's ethics officials. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.304(e)(2).	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
DATA ANALYSIS		%		
10.7	Percentage of SGEs who received initial ethics training. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.304.	N/A		
10.8	Percentage of SGEs who received initial ethics training timely. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.304(b)(2).	N/A		
10.9	Percentage of SGEs who received annual ethics training. <i>See</i> 5 C.F.R. § 2638.307(d)(2).	N/A		
COMMENTS				
10.2-10.4: PCLOB's board is comprised of PAS employees that file public financial disclosures; they are captured in section 3. 10.7-10.9: PCLOB's board is comprised of PAS employees that file public financial disclosures; their annual ethics training data is captured in 8.7				

ISSUES IDENTIFIED AND RESOLVED DURING THE INSPECTION

Element	ISSUE
4.8	<u>ISSUE:</u> A recommendation to ensure that confidential financial disclosure reports are collected timely issued. This recommendation was issued based on a review of PCLOB's 2025 data. In lieu of a follow-up inspection, OGE has reviewed PCLOB's 2026 data and found that all confidential financial disclosure reports were collected, reviewed, and certified timely.
7.2, 8.2	<u>ISSUE:</u> Initial and annual ethics training presentations from PCLOB did not include contact information for agency ethics officials. <u>AGENCY RESPONSE:</u> PCLOB submitted updated annual and initial ethics training presentations that included contact information for agency ethics officials.
6.3	<u>ISSUE:</u> Notices to new supervisors did not include a copy of, a hyperlink to, or the address of a Web site containing the Principles of Ethical Conduct. <u>AGENCY RESPONSE:</u> PCLOB submitted an updated template for notices to new supervisors that includes a hyperlink to the Principles of Ethical Conduct.

RECOMMENDATIONS

#	Element	RECOMMENDATION	Compliance Due
1	3.12, 3.13	<u>RECOMMENDATION:</u> Ensure termination reports from non-PAS filers are certified within 60 days of receipt.	09/16/2026
2	3.15	<u>RECOMMENDATION:</u> Collect termination reports for PAS filers and ensure late collection fees are assessed or waived as appropriate. <u>AGENCY RESPONSE:</u> When the litigation is complete, the agency will update OGE and ensure that all necessary/required steps are taken.	09/16/2026

ETHICS PROGRAM INSPECTION REPORT

Agency: Privacy and Civil Liberties Oversight Board

Report No.: 26-19I

Date: 3/19/2026

Period Covered by Review: January 1, 2025 through December 31, 2025

UNITED STATES OFFICE OF
GOVERNMENT ETHICS


Preventing Conflicts of Interest
in the Executive Branch

3	3.17	<p><u>RECOMMENDATION:</u> Ensure annual and termination reports from PAS filers are certified within 60 days of receipt.</p> <p><u>AGENCY RESPONSE:</u> When the litigation is complete, the agency will update OGE and ensure that all necessary/required steps are taken.</p>	09/16/2026
---	------	---	------------

GENERAL AGENCY COMMENTS

The agency appreciates OGE's continued engagement to help us continually improve and refine the agency's program. Two of the Senate-confirmed PAS filers terminated during the period audited are challenging their terminations in Federal court, preventing the filers/agency from processing required public financial disclosure reports. When the litigation is complete, the agency will update OGE and process required reports to completion. The Government's position is that the two PAS filers challenging their terminations in Federal court were properly terminated. Although PCLOB issued termination report filing notices to these two filers, neither filer will comply with the requirement since it concedes the ultimate issue in the litigation (i.e., that they were lawfully terminated).